



# **CITY OF LIVERMORE BEAUTIFICATION COMMITTEE RULES OF PROCEDURE**

Prepared by the City Clerk's Office  
April 2022



## **CITY OF LIVERMORE BEAUTIFICATION COMMITTEE RULES OF PROCEDURE**

1. Duties and Responsibilities – The Beautification Committee shall have the following duties and responsibilities:
  - A. Designate and plan specific sites and extended areas, primarily under governmental ownership or control, for the beautification of major roadway systems, median islands, and entranceways throughout the city.
  - B. Review the designs for establishment of small parks or rest areas at street intersections.
  - C. In cooperation with the City Neighborhood Preservation Division, analyze and recommend property rehabilitation of singular or group areas under private ownership within the City.
  - D. Recommend revisions of the street tree ordinance, specifying tree types, installation standards, spacing dimensions, and other related matters for the implantation of decorative trees in all areas to be developed within the city in both residential and commercial areas.
  - E. Recommend an annual program by the city for the placement of street trees in all areas deficient in such improvements.
  - F. Recommend landscaping standards for publicly controlled landscaping associated with commercial and industrial development.
  - G. Recommend replacement landscaping, planting and maintenance standards for all of the landscape maintenance districts within the City of Livermore.
  - H. Review and comment upon proposals for the installation of street furnishing and accessories, lights, ornamental fixtures, monuments, fountains, or other forms of furnishing of an aesthetic nature as to location, design, and cost.

- I. Analyze and recommend the application for and utilization of programs wherein financial grants or personal services may be applicable and available to support the beautification effort of the City.
  - J. As requested by Council, propose, and recommend a master plan for Livermore beautification with detailed standards for aspects of city beautification.
  - K. Organize, publicize, and participate in annual city-wide activities and events, such as Earth Day, Make A Difference Day, and Arbor Day, and present beautification awards to enhance city aesthetics.
  - L. Support the goals and priorities adopted by the City Council.
2. Members – The Beautification Committee shall consist of 7 members, all of whom must be residents of the City of Livermore.
  3. Term limits – Beautification Committee members shall serve no more than two consecutive four-year terms or a total of eight years unless the member was selected to complete an unexpired term or unless otherwise noted. However, members may be appointed back to the Beautification Committee after a break in service of two years.

Time served in an unexpired term shall not count against the eight-year maximum limit. Committee members who have already completed eight years of service or other specified maximum terms are not eligible for appointment to an unexpired term.
  4. Attendance Policy – Beautification Committee members may miss four meetings per calendar year. A member who misses more than four meetings per year may be subject to removal from the Committee. The staff liaison will document all absences and report to the City Clerk when a member of the Committee has exceeded the allowed number of absences. The City Clerk will notify the City Council with a memo explaining the circumstances of the absences and the City Council will determine if an agenda item is needed to consider whether removal from the Committee is appropriate. The member will have the opportunity to speak at a City Council meeting when removal is under consideration. The final decision to remove a member from the Committee rests solely with the City Council.
  5. Elections and Officers – The Beautification Committee shall elect a chairperson and a vice chairperson at the first meeting held after January 1<sup>st</sup> of each year. Election of the officers shall be by majority vote of the Committee. The role of the officers shall be as follows:

- a. Chairperson – The Chairperson shall preside at all regular meetings and may call special meetings. The Chairperson shall decide upon all points of order and procedure during the meeting.
  - b. Vice Chairperson - The Vice Chairperson shall assume all duties of the Chairperson in the absence or disability of the Chairperson.
  - c. Presiding Officer – In the absence of the Chairperson or Vice Chairperson, the members present shall select a Presiding Officer.
6. Meetings – The Beautification Committee shall meet on the first Wednesday of each month at 6:00 p.m. at the William H. Mendenhall Community Room at 1016 S. Livermore Avenue, Livermore, CA. Meetings shall begin promptly as noticed pursuant to this provision. The Committee shall adopt an annual meeting calendar listing all regular meetings for the calendar year. The calendar shall be published on the City's website. All meetings shall be open to the public. The Committee may not meet in closed session. Committee members may not participate in a meeting remotely, via teleconference or videoconference.
7. Agenda Preparation and Posting – The staff liaison shall post the notices and agendas for each Beautification Committee meeting in the kiosk in front of the Civic Center Meeting Hall, the Civic Center Library, and on the City's website.
- a. Regular Meetings
- Agendas shall be prepared in accordance with the requirements of the Brown Act and shall be posted in a location that is freely accessible to members of the public at least 72 hours in advance of a regular meeting. The agenda shall specify the time and location of the meeting and contain a brief description of each item of business to be transacted or discussed at the meeting. [54954.2]
- b. Special Meetings and Workshops
- Notice of the call for a special meeting must be delivered and received by each Committee Member and the media at least 24 hours before the special meeting and must be posted at least 24 hours before the special meeting date. The agenda shall specify the time and location of the meeting, contain a brief description of each item of business to be transacted or discussed at the meeting, and state who called the special meeting. [54956].
8. Minutes – An account of all proceedings of the Beautification Committee shall be prepared by the staff liaison and approved by the Committee. The staff liaison with input from the City Clerk, and consistent with the uniform format provided by the City Clerk, shall determine the preferred software/recording device used to capture the minutes for their advisory body meetings. Minutes shall be provided for Committee consideration and approval as action minutes.

9. Quorum – Four members constitute a quorum of the Beautification Committee. A quorum of the members must be present to conduct any business. In the absence of a quorum at a meeting, the meeting must be adjourned. The matters listed on the agenda shall be taken up at the next regularly scheduled meeting of the Committee or scheduled for a special meeting if deemed necessary. A meeting may also be declared adjourned in advance, if absence notifications received by staff create a lack of a quorum. Cancellations of meetings must comply with the requirements of the Brown Act.
  
10. Conduct at Meetings
  - a. All meetings shall be held in accordance with City policies and the Brown Act Open Meeting Laws (Government Code, Sections 54950 and following). Only items listed on the agenda may be considered by the Committee.
  
  - b. General Conduct of Meetings – Points of order shall be settled by the Chairperson. Points of order shall comply with the Brown Act, Rosenberg’s Rules of Order, Revised 2011, Beautification Committee Rules of Procedure and City policies. The Chairperson will consult with staff as necessary. Unresolved issues shall be referred to the City Attorney and continued to a future meeting. Any member desiring to speak must first be recognized by the Chairperson and shall confine any remarks to the subject under consideration.
  
  - c. Voting on Items – Voting on items shall be in accordance with Rosenberg’s Rules of Order, Revised 2011 and Parliamentary Procedures. The Beautification Committee shall not take a sealed ballot vote in open session.
  
  - d. Call to Order - The Chairperson shall call the meeting to order at the appointed time. If both the Chairperson and the Vice Chairperson are absent, then the staff liaison shall call the meeting to order and the Committee Members present shall then select a presiding officer for that meeting.
  
  - e. Preservation of Order - The Chairperson shall preserve strict order and decorum, and shall discourage personal, verbal attacks on Committee Members, staff, and/or citizens, but shall not prohibit criticisms of the policies, procedures, programs, or services of the City, or of the acts or omissions of the Beautification Committee or members of the City staff. The Chairperson shall confine debate to the item under discussion. [36813, 38638, 54954.3, 54957.9].

- f. Reordering of Agenda - The Chairperson may reorder the items on the agenda for a noticed meeting to accommodate members of the public who wish to speak on an agenda item that would otherwise be considered by the Beautification Committee later in the meeting. The Chairperson shall announce the reorder prior to calling members of the public to speak during citizens forum.
- g. Motion to be Stated - The Chairperson shall state all motions submitted for a vote by the Beautification Committee and announce the result of the vote and identify the no votes and any Committee Members that abstained or recused themselves from the vote. No action shall be taken by secret ballot, but electronic tabulation may be used to record and report roll call votes. [54953(b)(2) and (c)(2)].

#### 11. Citizens' Forum/Public Comments

Every agenda shall provide the opportunity for members of the public to address the Beautification Committee on subjects which are not listed on the agenda and are within the subject matter jurisdiction of the Committee. The Chairperson may establish time limits per individual speaker. The Committee shall not discuss nor take action on subjects raised under Citizens' Forum/Public Comments; but the Chairperson, with the concurrence of a majority of the Committee, may direct staff to place subjects raised under Citizens' Forum/Public Comments on a future Committee agenda.

#### 12. Subcommittees

The Beautification Committee may create standing subcommittees (those with ongoing subject-matter jurisdiction and regularly scheduled meetings). Such subcommittees shall be subject to all City policies and the requirements of the Brown Act.

#### 13. Staff Support

The head of the department that is responsible for supporting the Beautification Committee shall designate one or more employees to serve as staff liaison to the Committee. The Staff Liaison shall prepare and post the agenda, take and maintain meeting minutes, prepare other documents as directed by the Chairperson in accordance with City Council Goals and Priorities or in accordance with direction from the City Manager or City Manager's designee, and generally assist the Committee in performing its duties. The Staff Liaison shall have no voting authority.

Committee Members must work with their assigned staff liaison and the liaison's Department Head to obtain the City Council's approval before

beginning any self-initiated project that will require more than 8 hours of staff time to complete that year. However, the Commission may pursue self-initiated projects that can be accomplished utilizing the city resources currently allocated to the particular advisory body and that do not take resources away from that advisory body's anticipated work to fulfill its duties and responsibilities to the City Council.

#### 14. Rules of Parliamentary Procedure

The City Council has adopted Rosenberg's Rules of Order, Revised 2011, as its rules of parliamentary procedure for the City Council and all Boards and Commissions. In the event of a conflict between Rosenberg's Rules of Order and these rules of procedure, these rules of procedure shall control.

#### 15. Types of Meetings

##### 15.1 Regular Meetings

The Beautification Committee shall meet in the William H. Mendenhall Community Room for all regular Committee meetings. The regular meetings shall begin on the first Wednesday of each month at 6:00 p.m., unless otherwise specified by posted notice. If the meeting date falls on a legal holiday, the Beautification Committee shall meet at a date and time designated by the Committee.

##### 15.2 Special Meetings

Special meetings may be called by the Committee Chair, the Committee liaison or by a majority of Committee Members. The call and notice for a special meeting must specify the items to be considered and the date, time, and location for the meeting. [36807, 54956(a)].

The Beautification Committee may take final action at a special meeting that is not a workshop.

##### 15.3 Special Meeting Workshops

The Beautification Committee may meet informally in special meetings designated as workshops that are called by the Chairperson, the Committee liaison, or by a majority of Committee Members. Workshops are special meetings intended for training purposes such as ethics training, sexual harassment prevention and education, and specific technical subjects.

Workshops are open to the public and are meetings for purposes of the Brown Act. The Beautification Committee may provide direction, but unlike other special

meetings the Beautification Committee may not take a final action at a workshop. [54956].

#### 15.4 Adjourned Meetings, and Adjourned Regular Meetings

Any meeting of the Beautification Committee may be adjourned to a later date, time, and location, and the notice of adjournment shall be posted within 24 hours on or near the door of the place where the adjourned meeting was held. However, if the adjourned meeting is to reconvene less than 24 hours after adjournment, then a copy of the order or notice of the continuance shall be posted immediately following the meeting. [36809, 54955].

The Chairperson, Committee liaison, or majority of Committee Members may call for an adjourned regular meeting in consultation with the City Attorney to conduct a regular meeting on a date other than on a regular meeting date on the Beautification Committee's annual calendar. [54955]

#### 16 Actions Limited to Posted Agendas

The Beautification Committees shall not discuss or take action on any item not appearing on the posted notice or agenda for that meeting. However, as permitted by the Brown Act, Committee Members and staff may briefly respond to statements made or questions posed by the Beautification Committee or by members of the public addressing the Beautification Committee. Committee Members may ask a question of City staff or a speaker for clarification, make a brief announcement, or make a brief report on their own activities.

#### 17. Continuance of Agenda Items

Items listed on a posted agenda should not be continued or postponed absent good cause.

##### 17.1 Discovery of Good Cause Before an Item is Considered

If good cause to continue an item is discovered by City staff after a notice or agenda is posted but before the meeting commences, then after calling the meeting to order the Chair shall identify the item and announce that it has been continued.

##### 17.2 Good Cause to Continue During Consideration

Once an item has been taken up for consideration, City staff, a Committee Member, or a participating party as defined in Section 21.4.4 Participating Parties may request a continuance of the item. The item may only be continued following a majority vote of the Committee Members present.



### 17.3 Public Comment for a Continued Item

If the opportunity for the public to address the Beautification Committee has concluded and the item was returned to the Beautification Committee for deliberation before it was continued, then the opportunity for public comment on the item will not be reopened absent a motion by the Beautification Committee. [54955].

## 18 Consideration of items after 11:00 p.m.

### 18.1 Canvass and Reorder

At 10:30 p.m., or as soon thereafter as practical, the Chairperson shall canvass staff and Committee Members present to identify the remaining agenda items for consideration. The Chairperson will then identify what items will be considered or continued, and in what order. Once the Chairperson outlines the balance of the agenda, it may not be amended absent an appeal by a Committee Member.

### 18.2 No New Items Considered after 11:00 p.m.

Generally, the Beautification Committee will not begin consideration of any items on an agenda after 11:00 p.m., but may complete their consideration of an item that was commenced prior to 11:00 p.m.

### 18.3 Exceptions

The Beautification Committee may commence consideration of an item after 11:00 under the following circumstances:

- a. An item is subject to a legal deadline, or,
- b. The Beautification Committee votes to allow consideration of the item after 11:00 p.m.

## 19. Points of Order, Privilege, and Personal Privilege

A Committee Member may ask for a point of order, at which time the Chairperson will ask for an explanation. Appropriate points of order relate to matters that a Committee Member considers inappropriate conduct for the meeting, such as the failure to observe these Rules of Procedure or the rules of parliamentary procedure.

A Committee Member may seek a point of privilege. If so, the Chairperson shall ask for an explanation of the Committee Member's point. Points of privilege generally relate to matters that interfere with a normal flow or comfort of the

Beautification Committee's meeting, such as the inability to hear testimony because of disruption.

A Committee Member may ask for a point of personal privilege when the integrity, character, or motives of the Committee Member are called into question by a speaker; or where the welfare of the Beautification Committee is concerned.

If a speaker is interrupted by a point of order, privilege, or personal privilege, the remainder of a speaker's time will be preserved by the staff liaison until the point is resolved.

20. Minutes - An account of all final actions or recommendations of the Beautification Committee shall be prepared by the staff liaison and approved by the Committee. The staff liaison with input from the City Clerk, and consistent with the uniform format provided by the City Clerk, shall determine the preferred software/recording device used to capture the minutes for their advisory body meetings. Minutes shall be provided for Committee consideration and approval as action minutes.

#### 20.1 Approval

The minutes for a Beautification Committee meeting shall be reviewed and approved as set forth in this section.

- a. The Beautification Committee shall approve minutes for a regular meeting, special meeting, and special meeting workshops.
- b. A Beautification Committee Member may not approve the minutes for any meeting that the Committee Member did not attend.

Also, Beautification Committee Members may not approve the minutes for a meeting that they were not eligible to attend as a Committee Member.

- c. If no Committee Members are eligible to approve the minutes for a Beautification Committee meeting, then the staff liaison shall attest to the accuracy of the meeting minutes and enter them into official minute books.

#### 20.2 Preferred Method of Recordation and Minutes

Beautification Committee liaisons shall take an audio recording of each meeting and keep them in accordance with the City's Records Retention Schedule. Minutes of Beautification Committee meetings shall be action minutes that capture the action taken by the Beautification Committee and the outcome of each agenda item.

20.3 Staff Attendance & Development of Agenda - Staff attendance and agenda development will be determined by the staff liaison for the advisory body.

## 21. Order of Business – Regular Meetings

The usual order of business for regular meetings shall be as follows:

### 21.1. Call to Order

This portion of the agenda is for roll call and the pledge of allegiance.

### 21.2. Citizens Forum

This portion of the agenda is for any member of the public to address the Beautification Committee on any item of interest to the public that is within the Beautification Committee’s subject matter jurisdiction. However, to prepare and preserve a proper administrative record, public comments concerning an item listed elsewhere on the agenda should be reserved and addressed to the Beautification Committee when that item is called for consideration.

Citizens forum shall be limited to 30 minutes, usually before the consent calendar. If there are additional members of the public who wish to speak at the conclusion of the 30-minute time period, then the Chair shall reconvene the citizens forum at the conclusion of the matters for consideration portion of the agenda unless the Chair announces that citizens forum is reordered to a different place on the agenda.

The procedures for public comments during the citizens forum are set forth in Section 23 Citizens’ Rights.

### 21.3. Consent Calendar

The consent calendar portion of the agenda is for routine items that are not expected to require Beautification Committee discussion. Examples of items for the consent calendar include the approval of minutes. Any Beautification Committee Member may pull an item for separate discussion. Members of the public may address the Beautification Committee on consent calendar items by following the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens’ Rights.

The items on the consent calendar are generally approved by the Beautification Committee by a single motion, but separate motions may be appropriate to accommodate a conflict of interest, an absence, or other Committee Member interests.

### 21.4. Matters for Consideration

This portion of the agenda is for items of business that require Beautification Committee action, direction, or receipt of reports that do not also require a public hearing. The procedures for this portion of the agenda follow the following procedure:

#### 21.4.1 Introduction

The Chairperson shall call each item for hearing and consideration. If there are public hearing items, the Chairperson has the discretion to concurrently call the items for hearing and consideration.

#### 21.4.2 Staff Presentation

A member of City staff will then:

- a. Introduce themselves and the item by identifying the report and other written material included in the agenda packet for the Beautification Committee's consideration, as well as any written comments received from the public.
- b. Identify any supplemental written materials that have been provided to the Beautification Committee for consideration, which were received or prepared for the item after the meeting agenda was published.
- c. Identify any other staff members or consultants that will be part of the staff presentation or are otherwise present and available for the Beautification Committee's questions.
- d. State whether the applicant is present and whether the applicant intends to make a presentation to the Beautification Committee.
- e. Make an oral report, unless waived by the Committee.

#### 21.4.3 Beautification Committee Questions or Comments

Following the staff presentation, the Committee Members may ask questions of City staff and consultants or make comments on the item.

#### 21.4.4 Participating Parties

Following Committee Member questions and comments after the staff presentation, the applicant, appellant, and other named participant in the item that is party to an agenda item (collectively "participating parties") may address the Committee. After the Chair determines that no other participating parties wish to address the Beautification Committee on the item, the Chairperson will then invite Committee Member questions or comments of the participating parties and

staff concerning the item. Participating parties shall address the Beautification Committee following the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens' Rights.

#### 21.4.5 Opportunity for Public Comment

The purpose of the public hearing is to provide members of the public with an opportunity to address the Beautification Committee concerning the item, as well as to express their support or opposition of the item. The Chairperson will formally announce the opening of the public comment period and invite members of the public to address the Beautification Committee on the item. Public speakers shall address the Beautification Committee following the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens' Rights.

After the Chairperson determines that no other member of the public wishes to address the Beautification Committee on the hearing item, the Chairperson will formally close the public comment period and return the item to the Beautification Committee for deliberation.

#### 21.4.6 Deliberation

Once an item of business returns to the Beautification Committee for deliberation, the Chairperson will invite the Committee Members to discuss the item to develop concurrence for a motion. Committee Members may ask questions of staff and the participating parties as part of their deliberations.

#### 21.4.7. Beautification Committee Action

After Beautification Committee deliberation, the Chairperson shall call for a motion and a second as set forth in Section 25 Motions, and the Beautification Committee may make such motions as set forth in that section.

If the motion seconded for consideration is substantially different than the recommended action in the published staff report, the Chairperson may invite public comments on the motion. Each speaker will be limited to one minute to comment on the motion; and the Beautification Committee has discretion to decide not to hear further comment if they choose. Public speakers shall address the Beautification Committee following the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens' Rights.

Prior to deliberating on matters for consideration, the Beautification Committee shall receive public comment as provided for in Section 23 Citizens' Rights. After receiving public comment, the Beautification Committee shall deliberate and shall receive the report, take action, or provide direction as set forth in Section 25 Motions.

### 21.5 Reports and Matters Initiated

This portion of the agenda is for:

- a. Each member of the Beautification Committee to provide brief reports on any conferences, training, community meetings, or other events of interest to the community that the Committee Member attended at the City's expense [53232.2(d)].
- b. The city staff to provide information of community interest to the Beautification Committee and to seek direction from the Beautification Committee concerning items to be included on future agendas.
- c. The Beautification Committee to provide guidance and direction to staff concerning items to be included on future agendas and information to be provided in response to questions raised during citizens forum.
- d. The Beautification Committee to request staff to provide information, perform studies, or undertake other administrative functions or to develop information for Committee action at a future meeting. If the requested action cannot be accomplished within the approved budget or if it will involve substantial staff resources, approval of resources would need to be provided from the City Council prior to staff completing the work.

Members of the public do not have the right to address the Beautification Committee during this portion of the agenda. [54954.3(a); Coalition of Labor, Agriculture & Business v. County of Santa Barbara Bd. of Supervisors, (2005) 129 Cal.App.4th 205].

## 21.6 Adjournment

This portion of the agenda is for the Chairperson to adjourn the Beautification Committee meeting to its next meeting. The meeting may be adjourned to a regular meeting, special meeting, special meeting workshop, adjourned regular meeting, or adjourned special meeting.

Members of the public do not have the right to address the Beautification Committee during this portion of the agenda. [54954.3(a); Coalition of Labor, Agriculture & Business v. County of Santa Barbara Bd. of Supervisors, (2005) 129 Cal.App.4th 205].

Adjournment at any other point in the meeting requires a formal motion by the Beautification Committee.

## 22. Order of Business – Special Meetings and Workshops

No matters except those specified in the notice and agenda for a special meeting or special meeting workshop may be discussed at those meetings.

The usual order of business for special meetings and workshops shall be as follows:

#### 22.1. Call to Order

This portion of the agenda is the same as it is for a regular meeting.

#### 22.2. Public Comment

The purpose of this portion of the agenda is to provide the public with the opportunity to address the Beautification Committee on only those items listed in the posted notice and agenda for the special meeting or workshop.

Public speakers shall address the Beautification Committee following the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens' Rights.

However, unlike a regular meeting, the agenda for a special meeting will not include a citizens' forum or opportunity for the public to address the Beautification Committee on any item of interest to the public that is within the Committee's subject matter jurisdiction, unless that opportunity is expressly included in the agenda.

#### 22.3 Special Meeting Item and Workshop Item

Generally, the procedures for this portion of the agenda follow the procedures in Section 21.4.1 Introduction, 21.4.2 Staff Presentation, 21.4.3 Questions and Comments, and 21.4.6 Deliberations. The Beautification Committee may take a final action at a special meeting, but not at a workshop, as set forth in Section 15.2 Special Meetings and Section 15.3 Special Meeting Workshops

#### 22.4 Adjournment

This portion of the agenda is the same as it is for a regular meeting.

#### 23. Citizens' Rights

A Beautification Committee meeting is a limited public forum. [78 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen. 224 (1995); Kindt v. Santa Monica Rent Control Bd. (9th Cir. 1995) 67 F.3d 266; White v. City of Norwalk, (9th Cir. 1990) 900 F.2d 1421; Leventhal v. Vista Unified School District (SD Cal. 1997) 973 F.Supp. 951]. Members of the public have the right to address the Beautification Committee and to attend its meetings. During the citizens forum portion of a regular meeting agenda, members of the public have a right to address the Beautification

Committee on any item of interest to the public that is within the Beautification Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. Members of the public also have the right to address the Beautification Committee before the Beautification Committee considers or takes action on an item on any regular meeting agenda, except for items properly listed or considered in the Call to Order, Beautification Committee Reports and Matters Initiated, and the Adjournment portions of the agenda. Members of the public shall be provided an opportunity to address the Beautification Committee concerning any item that is described in the notice for special meeting workshops and special meetings. [54954.3].

The procedures for addressing public comments to the Beautification Committee are as follows:

### 23.1 Addressing the Beautification Committee

Members of the public that want to address the Beautification Committee during citizens forum or before the Beautification Committee considers or takes action on an item must indicate their desire by personally submitting a request to speak to the staff liaison, or his or her designee, using the methods specified by the staff liaison in the agenda for that meeting. A member of the public may not submit a request to speak on behalf of any other person. The methods for addressing the Beautification Committee will be described at each meeting. The staff liaison will prominently display the methods to address the Beautification Committee in the William H. Mendenhall Community Room.

Before an item is considered by the Beautification Committee, the staff liaison shall identify or provide a list of the speakers to the presiding officer in the order that they are received for each agenda item. Generally, once the Beautification Committee begins its consideration of an item, no additional requests to speak will be accepted absent invitation by the presiding officer.

The purpose of submitting a request to speak is to help the presiding officer conduct the Beautification Committee's meetings and to complete its business in an orderly fashion. The intent is not to limit testimony. Therefore, a member of the public will not be denied an opportunity to speak if a request to speak lacks information or because a speaker wants to remain anonymous.

Speakers who have not submitted a request to speak on time may be heard by the presiding officer's recognition or by another Beautification Committee's successful appeal. [White v. City of Norwalk, (9th Cir. 1990) 900 F.2d 1421].

### 23.2 Speaker Time Limit

Each advisory body, with input from the City Clerk and consistent with the uniform format provided by the City Clerk, may establish their own rules to specify the method to request, and the speaker time limits, for citizens



addressing the advisory body, but the advisory body must then administer them uniformly.

### 23.3 Members of the Public Addressing the Beautification Committee

23.3.1 A list of people who have requested to speak shall be used to call each speaker to address the Beautification Committee. When calling a speaker to the lectern the next two speakers will also be identified so, they are prepared to address the Beautification Committee when called.

23.3.2 The Chairperson may request each speaker to state his or her name and city of residence before addressing the Beautification Committee. A speaker is not required to provide his or her name or address to address the Beautification Committee. However, to the extent such information is relevant to the issues being considered by the Beautification Committee, the absence of such information may bear on the speaker's credibility and the weight the Beautification Committee affords the speaker's comments.

23.3.3 Speakers shall address their comments only to the Beautification Committee as a body and not to a particular member.

23.3.4 Members of the public may only address the Beautification Committee from the lectern. No member of the public, other than the speaker at the lectern, may address the Beautification Committee, unless called upon by the Chairperson.

23.3.5 No question shall be asked of Committee Members by a speaker, except through the Chairperson. No question shall be asked of a speaker by a Committee Member, except through the Chairperson. Committee Members, the Chairperson, and the speaker are not obligated to answer any questions asked. The Chairperson may refer questions to staff for a brief answer while the speaker is at the lectern.

23.3.6 Speakers shall not use their time to unduly disrupt the orderly conduct of the Beautification Committee's meeting.

23.3.7 Speakers are encouraged to avoid repetition.

23.3.8 Speakers are encouraged to avoid making personal attacks.

23.3.9 Each speaker shall relinquish the lectern when his or her time to address the Beautification Committee has expired.

23.3.10 A speaker may use his or her allotted time to read letters or other documents, play electronic recordings at a non-amplified volume, or otherwise present information to the Beautification Committee in a non-disruptive manner,

provided those activities are completed within the allotted time. The city will not provide the means for a speaker to play an electronic recording.

23.3.11 When called upon during citizen's forum, speakers may address the Beautification Committee on any item of interest to the public within the Beautification Committee's subject matter jurisdiction. [54954.3(a)].

23.3.12 When called upon to provide public comment on a specific item of business on the agenda, speakers shall focus their comments on that specific item of business before the Beautification Committee. [54954.3(a); White v. City of Norwalk, (9th Cir. 1990) 900 F.2d 1421; 78 Ops.Cal.Atty.Gen 224 (1995)].

#### 23.4 Participating Parties Addressing the Beautification Committee

Participating parties shall comply with the procedures set forth in Section 23 Citizens' Rights when addressing the Beautification Committee, except that the participating parties shall each have up to a maximum of 10 minutes to address the Beautification Committee. The Chairperson may set and announce the time limit for each active participant to address the Beautification Committee based upon the same criteria set forth in Section 23.2 Speaker Time Limit.

#### 23.5 Public Criticism

Public criticism of the City's policies, procedures, programs, or services, or of the acts or omissions of the Beautification Committee, shall not be prohibited. However, the rights of each speaker to express his or her views is not absolute and nothing in these rules of procedure are intended to confer any privilege or protection for expression beyond that otherwise provided by law. [54954.3].

#### 23.6 Disruptive Speech and Conduct

Any person unduly disrupting a Beautification Committee meeting may be requested by the Chairperson to leave the meeting. The Chairperson shall discourage demonstrations before the Beautification Committee, such as applauding or booing. Upon instructions by the Chairperson, a Sergeant-at-Arms may be called for the purpose of removing any person who, in the Chairperson's judgment, has disrupted the meeting. [36813, 38638, 54954.3, 54957.9, Penal Code 403]. When possible, the Chairperson is encouraged to use alternative means, such as direction to speakers to avoid disruption or by taking a recess to review these rules with the speaker, to avoid disruptions to allow the Beautification Committee to complete its business.

#### 23.7 Written Communications – Post Hearing Notice, and Post Agenda Publication

23.7.1 Submitted after the hearing notice, but before the Agenda Publication.

Any member of the public may submit written comments and materials to the Beautification Committee through the Beautification Committee Liaison. All written comments and materials must be submitted between by noon on the day before agenda publication (3 days prior to the meeting). The Beautification Committee Liaison shall deliver all written comments and materials received by 12:00 p.m. the day before agenda publication as part of the agenda packet for the posted agenda.

#### 23.7.2 Submitted Post Agenda Publication.

Any member of the public may submit electronic comments to the Beautification Committee using the electronic submission process the staff liaison specifies and makes available on the City's website within the timeframe provided on the agenda. Any additional attachments can be submitted directly to the staff liaison. All comments submitted using the staff liaison's electronic process will be available to the public and the Beautification Committee immediately upon submission. The staff liaison shall post on the City's website and deliver any additional materials received by 12:00 p.m. the day of the meeting to the Beautification Committee in a supplemental packet prior to the meeting.

Physical copies of written comments and materials, and electronic and physical materials submitted to the Beautification Committee liaison before 12:00 p.m. noon on the day of the Beautification Committee meeting, will be included in the supplemental packet. After 12:00 p.m. noon on the day of the Beautification Committee meeting, any member of the public that desires to submit materials to the Beautification Committee for consideration at that meeting is hereby instructed to present 9 copies of the materials to the staff liaison for distribution to the Beautification Committee at its meeting when the item is considered.

#### 23.7.3 Special Meetings and Workshops.

For special meetings and workshops, the staff liaison shall specify the instructions and timeframes for the public to submit comments and materials in the agenda for those meetings.

### 23.8 Approaching the Beautification Committee

Once a meeting is called to order, no member of the public shall enter the area between the Committee and public seating without an invitation from the Chairperson. Members of the public may enter the area before and after the meeting, and during a recess, for the purpose of interacting with the individual Committee Members and City staff.

### 24. Beautification Committee Deliberation

Beautification Committee deliberations shall be orderly and guided by the Chairperson to reach a decision on the item before them or to provide the direction sought by staff.

## 25. Motions

### 25.1 Making a Motion

A motion may be made by the Chairperson or a Committee Member. Once a motion has been made, the Chairperson will solicit a second. A motion shall die unless it receives a second. If a motion receives a second, the Chairperson shall then invite debate and discussion on the motion and any amendments.

Any Committee Member who makes a motion may withdraw it during debate and discussion, even to the point of interrupting a speaker to do so. If the motion is withdrawn, the Chairperson may ask the person who seconded the motion if the Committee Member wishes to make the motion, subject to another Committee Member's second.

### 25.2 Categories of Motions

There are four categories of motions that the Beautification Committee may consider.

The first category is a **basic motion**, which is one that puts forward a decision for consideration. For example, a motion to approve City staff's recommendation.

The second category is a **motion to amend** an earlier motion. Such an amending motion changes a basic motion under discussion in a minor way but does not supersede it. For example, adding a condition to a basic motion to approve staff's recommendation. If the maker of the basic motion, and the second, accept the amendment, then the amendment shall be incorporated into the original motion without the need for a second on the amending motion. If an amendment is not accepted into the basic motion by the moving Committee Members, the process for voting on simultaneous motions is then followed.

The third category is a **substitute motion**. Such a motion completely does away with the basic motion under discussion and puts a new motion before the Beautification Committee. For example, if the basic motion is to approve staff's recommendation, a substitute motion would propose numerous changes to staff's recommendation or assembles multiple amending motions into a single motion. If a substitute motion is approved, the initial basic motion does not require action since it was substituted. If a substitute motion fails, the process for voting on simultaneous motions is then followed.

The fourth category is a **hostile motion**. A hostile motion is one that seeks to accomplish the opposite effect of the basic motion. For example, when a basic motion is to approve a project, a hostile motion is one to deny the project. If a hostile motion is made, the process for voting on simultaneous motions is then followed.

A decision whether a motion is one to amend or substitute is left to the Chairperson's sole discretion. A decision whether a motion is hostile is left to the Chairperson in consultation with the Committee's Attorney.

### 25.3 Simultaneous Motions

The Beautification Committee may consider up to three motions on the floor at one time. The Chairperson may reject a fourth motion until the three before the Beautification Committee have been resolved. When two or three motions are before the Beautification Committee, after motions and seconds, the first vote will be on the last motion made. Generally, the discussion when a motion is before the Beautification Committee should focus on the last motion made. Once the vote on the last motion takes place, if necessary, discussion and decision on additional motions will take place in order.

However, a hostile motion shall not be in the floor at the same time as the motion it challenges. A hostile motion shall be considered after a vote on the basic motion and its amendments that it challenges.

### 25.4 Debatable and Non-debatable Motions

Debatable motions are subject to Committee Member comment and discussion before calling for a vote. Non-debatable motions are not subject to Committee Member comment and discussion and are to be voted on immediately.

#### 25.4.1 Debatable Motions

Debatable motions are motions to take action on agenda items and other items of City business. For the purpose of these rules of procedure, all motions are debatable except those expressly identified in subsection 25.4.2 Non-Debatable Motions. Debate on a motion should continue as long as Committee Members wish to discuss an item, subject to the Chairperson's decision that it is time to move on and take action.

#### 25.4.2 Non-Debatable Motions

Non-debatable motions are procedural and terminating motions. Certain motions once made immediately stop the Committee's deliberations and, upon receipt of a second, should be voted on immediately. The Committee's non-debatable motions are as follows:

- a. **Motion to Adjourn.** If passed, a motion to adjourn requires the Beautification Committee to immediately adjourn to its next regularly scheduled meeting.
- b. **Motion to Recess.** If passed, a motion to recess requires the Beautification Committee to immediately take a recess, the length of which the Chairperson will determine. The Chairperson may order a recess without a motion, and without adjourning the meeting, as the Chairperson determines necessary to maintain decorum and conduct the meeting in an orderly fashion.
- c. **Motion to Fix the Time to Adjourn.** If passed, a motion to fix the time to adjourn the meeting requires the Beautification Committee to adjourn at a specific time set in the motion.
- d. **Motion to Table an Item.** If passed, a motion to table an item postpones an item indefinitely or to a date and time certain set in the motion. If the motion does not contain a specific time, an additional motion is required to bring the item back to the Beautification Committee at a future meeting.
- e. **Motion to Continue an Item.** A motion to continue an item has the same effect as a motion to table but is generally used when good cause exists or in response to a request by staff, a Committee Member, or a participating party, as set forth in Section 17 Continuance of Agenda Items, or a scheduling problem arises. If passed, the motion continues the item indefinitely or to the date and time set in the motion. If the motion does not contain a specific time, an additional motion is required to bring the item back to the Beautification Committee at a future meeting.
- f. **Motion to Call the Question.** A motion to call the question, also known as moving the previous question or limiting debate, stops further Beautification Committee deliberation, debate, and discussion on an item. It can be stated as stopping debate or discussion within a certain period of time, such as 15 minutes. If seconded, the Chairperson shall then call for a vote on the motion or motions pending before the Beautification Committee as provided for in Section 10(g) Motion to Be Stated.

## 25.5 Miscellaneous Motions and Appeals

### 25.5.1 Motion to Reconsider

A motion to reconsider any action taken by the Beautification Committee may be made as follows: (1) The motion must be made by a Committee Member that voted along with majority that voted for the original motion that passed, although

the motion for reconsideration may be seconded by any Committee Member; (2) The motion must be made either at the meeting at which the action to be reconsidered was taken, or, at the next regular meeting, provided appropriate due process is afforded to any participating parties; (3) The motion is debatable; and (4) If any participating party has left the meeting, or if the motion comes at a subsequent meeting, the ultimate decision to be reconsidered must take place at a subsequent meeting.

#### 25.5.2 Committee Member Appeal

Any Committee Member may appeal any ruling by the Chairperson. If a Committee Member so moves and the motion is seconded, after debate, the ruling of the Chairperson may be reversed by majority vote. If an appeal is taken, the question shall be, "Shall the decision of the Chair be sustained?"

### 26. Action and Direction

#### 26.1 Votes, General Rules

Unless otherwise provided, the Beautification Committee's actions must be passed pursuant to a majority vote on a motion, and the motion may not be considered unless it is seconded. A simple majority vote by those Committee Members present is necessary to pass a motion providing direction to staff or establishing administrative policy.

Any Committee Member may, before the "Nays" are called for, demand that a roll call vote be taken on the motion before the Committee. The Chairperson's name shall be called last with other Committee Members' names called in alphabetical order by the staff liaison. Committee Members shall not give explanations for their vote during roll call.

If a motion does not receive the necessary majority vote for passage, the Chairperson may solicit additional discussion and another motion for further deliberation and voting. If further discussion and deliberation does not result in a motion receiving a majority vote necessary to pass a motion, the Chairperson may declare that "no action has been taken" and proceed with the remainder of the agenda. In the event of a tie vote, the procedures in section 26.2 Tie Votes, shall control.

If a Committee Member is present at the meeting but abstains from voting on a motion or is silent during the vote on the motion, then the rules in section 26.3 Abstentions and Silence shall govern how the Committee Member's silence or abstention is tabulated.

#### 26.2 Tie Votes

Generally, a motion fails if there is a tie vote. After a tie vote, the Chairperson may solicit additional discussion and another motion in an attempt to break the tie. If the tie vote occurs during a Committee Member absence, and the absent Committee Member does not have a conflict of interest related to the item being voted on, the Beautification Committee may continue the item to a subsequent meeting when the absent Committee Member is expected to be present in an effort to resolve the tie. If the tie vote is not resolved, the motion shall fail, and the Chairperson may declare that “no action has been taken” and proceed with the remainder of the agenda.

### 26.3 Abstentions and Silence

The City Council discourages abstentions since abstentions without legal conflict may impede the Beautification Committee’s actions, for example by causing a tie vote. Abstentions also deprive Livermore residents of one vote of seven and may diminish accountability of Committee Members on items of legitimate concern. At the same time, it is not the City Council’s intention to impede any individual Committee Member’s right to choose not to speak or vote on an item.

If any Committee Member wishes to abstain from voting on a motion, the Committee Member must announce the abstention when the item of business is first called for consideration and must not participate in the consideration of the item, in which case the minutes will reflect that the Committee Member abstained from the vote.

If the Committee Member does not announce an abstention when the item of business is first called for consideration, or the Committee Member participates in the consideration of the item, and the Committee Member’s abstains during the vote, then that Committee Member’s vote shall be tabulated in favor of the motion.

Silence of any Committee Member shall be tabulated along with the majority of the votes cast by the Committee Members present and voting on the motion since the silent Committee Member is conceding to the majority’s wishes.

This rule is intended to expressly modify Rosenberg’s Rules of Order, Revised 2011, for counting votes with regard to abstentions and silence by a Committee Member.

### 26.4 Protests

Any Committee Member shall have the right to enter into public record reasons for dissent or protests against any motion carried by the majority.

### 27. Appeals



In accordance with Livermore Municipal Code section 12.20.250 appeals of the director's decision related to tree permit applications processed through the Public Works Department shall be made to the Beautification Committee. Appeals of the Beautification Committee's determination shall be made to the City Council. The appeal shall be filed with the Public Works Department within 15 days following the actual date the decision was rendered.

Appeals from decisions of the Beautification Committee shall appear on the City Council agenda for discussion. Council has the options of affirming the action of the Committee, modifying the action of the Committee, referring the matter back to the Committee, or reversing the decision, unless otherwise required or provided by law.