May 18, 2023

RECEIVED

Steve Stewart, Planning Manager City of Livermore 1052 S Livermore Avenue Livermore, CA 94550

MAY 2 2 2023 PLANNING DIVISION

Dear Mr. Stewart:

We are the fourth generation owners of the Garaventa Hill property located north of Interstate-580, east of Vasco Road, and west of Laughlin Road in the City of Livermore (Property). We previously sent you a letter explaining that our family is unwilling to sell the Property to the City of Livermore (City) for open space and conservation purposes.

We understand the City intends to discuss our Property with the Altamont Landfill & Resource Recovery Facility Open Space Advisory Committee and the Citizens for Balanced Growth under the Dougherty Valley Settlement Agreement at its upcoming meetings on and that you have requested our responses to the following questions in anticipation of your meetings. We noted your question and our response and our family representative, Lisa Quisito, is available to speak with you if you have further questions:

1. Is there a willing seller?

No. Our property is not on the market for sale to any other private or public entity. As we explained in our prior letter, our family is not willing to the sell the Property to the City because we are in a binding contract with Lafferty to buy the Property.

2. Would the landowner be willing to sell the Property to the City as open space at \$10,000 per acre or some higher value?

No. As we noted in our response above, we are not willing to sell the Property to the City for open space purposes even at \$10,000 per acre or a higher amount based on the appraised value of the Property because we have an existing contract with Lafferty for the purchase of the Property for residential uses.

Sincerely,

Thank you for your inquiry.

David Ragland cc: Rich Garcher

Houldinto trustee for Sharm Albright and Karen Red Elk